This project has received funding from the European Union’s Seventh Framework Programme for research, technological development and demonstration under grant agreement n°6611188

Frank Escoubès | Imagination for People
CAPS Meeting
Brussels | July 8, 2015
What is Catalyst all about?

Catalyst is unique in the way it addresses the issue of co-creating new content online:

- More than sharing existing information (Social Media)
- More than the simple addition of individual intelligence (forums)
- More than simply reacting to individual contributions (Q&A, comments)
- More than simply focused on problem-solving (idea management)
- More than a popularity contest between competing ideas (votes)
The online collective intelligence offering is still in its infancy:

- Existing solutions are partial and strongly influenced by social media.
- Real “conversations” online are scarce (Facebook and Twitter are conversation-adverse).
- The collaborative space has been “hacked” by the reflex of speed-voting.
“Online discussions and co-creation is the future of the Internet, and probably the future of democracy. Catalyst is the first real attempt to address this revolution. We do 3 things: we structure conversations, we analyze them and we visualize them. No other tool does that.”

Catalyst mission statement
WHY DO WE THINK WE CAN CLAIM UNIQUENESS?

Because we carried out a formal benchmarking of 60 different tools!...

... And because we could not find anything close to Catalyst’s value proposition.

Here is how Catalyst compares:

- with existing tool on the CI continuum from data sensing to collective action
- on the level of co-creation it generates: from individual contributions to co-designed content
Catalyst compared to major categories of online tools

- Co-creation
  - Geo-Data visualization / collaborative geo-mapping
  - Social media groups
  - Concurrent writing
  - Bi-polar debate
  - Forum & Chat

- Individual contribution
  - Idea management software
  - Polls
  - E-petition
  - Voting
  - Participative budgeting
  - Collective decision making (team-based decision)
  - Liquid (delegative) democracy

- Raw data
- Debate
- Ideas
- Decisions
- Projects
Collective intelligence ecosystem
WHAT IS THEN OUR VALUE PROPOSITION?

- We do **structure the unstructured**
  - Linking posts to argumentative mapping
  - Making sense of complexity

- We do **facilitate ideation**
  - Promoting weak signals and orphan ideas by avoiding premature selection of options and ideas
  - Avoiding groupthink
  - Proposing multiple views of the discussion

- We designed a **common vocabulary** and gather data to analyze and improve online debates
  - Reducing the cognitive and financial cost of moderation (time, resources required, etc.)
  - Helping focus and direct attention of the participants
WHAT IS THEN OUR VALUE PROPOSITION?

- We open up what used to be closed complementary tools (even if they were developed open source)
  - Realizing true inter-operability between an ecosystem of tools
  - Covering the entire cycle of online debates

- We address the needs of all end-users
  - Community managers and moderators
  - Community members
  - Researchers and analysts
  - Decision-makers
The Catalyst Tools Ecosystem

Anna De Liddo, Thomas Ullmann and Michelle Bachler (Open University); Mark Klein (U. Zürich); Marc-Antoine Parent (ImaginationForPeople) July 2015
Collective Intelligence Spectrum

Model of Collective Intelligence (CI):
from sensing the environment, to interpreting it, to generating good options, taking decisions and coordinating action...
Collective Intelligence as an eco-system of tools
DISCUSS & OBSERVE
Assembl (social media integration) & DebateHub (new ibis tools for online discussion)
SUMMARISE
Assembl (Summarisation function and process)
MONITOR & MODERATE
Assemble, DebateHub, EdgeSense (Gauging the debate’s health and knowing where & how to intervene)

REFLECT, COMMUNICATE & SHARE
Co-construct and all tools (Reflect, Communicate & Share features within each tool, what they are and what can they be used for)

CATEGORISE & MAP
Contrast, disrupt, shift, develop and error assessments

SUMMARISE
Summarize (communicator function and process)
Reflect, Communicate & Share

- CI Dashboard and all tools (Reflect, Communicate & Share features within each tool, what they are and what can they be used for)

- Categorize & Map

- Summarise

- Monitor & Moderate

- Harvest"
Pain Points of Existing Social Innovation Platforms

- Poor Summarization
- Poor Visualization
- Shallow Contribution
- Poor Idea Evaluation
- Cognitive Clutters
- Platform Island and Balkanization
Collaborative Web Annotation and Knowledge Mapping Tool

litemap.open.ac.uk
HSBC has said 2014 was a "challenging year" after reporting a 17% drop in profit to $18.7bn (£12.2bn).

The bank blamed the negative effect of $2.4bn in fines and settlements and UK customer redress for the sharp fall.

The results follow allegations, which emerged earlier this month, that HSBC had helped people evade UK tax using hidden HSBC accounts in Geneva.

HSBC chief executive Stuart Gulliver saw his overall pay for the year fall to £7.6m from £8.03m in 2013.

The lower total reflects a smaller bonus of £3.4m for the year, compared to £5.5m in 2013. Mr Gulliver said the lower bonus reflected "failures" linked to foreign exchange manipulation.

Chairman Douglas Flint's total pay increased to £2.5m from £2.4m for the year, but he did not receive a bonus.
The Web harvesting capability of LiteMap helps users to summarize online Debates by highlighting and marking up key content in a debate.

This helps to distill key content and distinguish it from the noise.

Ones harvested the content go to a inbox ready to be visually mapped.
E-mail management solutions

What are the related issues of possible e-mail management solutions for a community?

Harvesting INBOX

Argument Map
Where online debate become too long and argumentation chains too difficult to identify, Argument Maps help users to make sense of the argumentation chains by making them visible.
Ones harvested the content go to a inbox ready to be visually mapped

LiteMap enables users to create Argument Maps.

Argument Maps help users to better visualize online debates (beyond simple list of posts) by using hints such as: iconography, link colors, spatial distribution of the nodes and a specific network structure which highlights specific debate content types (issues, ideas and arguments).
By allowing linking and mapping of annotated content from different websites, discussion tools and forums, LiteMap helps map out debates across and beyond specialized tools and communities.
Tackled Pain Points of Existing Social Innovation Platforms

- Poor Summarization
- Poor Visualization
- Shallow Contribution
- Poor Idea Evaluation
- Cognitive Clutters
- Platform Island and Balkanization
Structured Online Discussion and Argumentation

debatehub.net
DISCUSS & OBSERVE
Assembl (social media integration) & DebateHub (new ibis tools for online discussion)

MONITOR & MODERATE
Assemble, DebateHub, EdgeSense (Gauging the debate’s health and knowing where & how to intervene)
What would attract you to work in a civic sector organization?

Please add ideas on what would be your main motivation and reward for working in the civic society sector.

Ends in: 181 days 0hrs 1min
Views: 215  Ideas: 7  Participants: 3  Votes: 6

Better pays would help  /x  100%
Civic society organisations often come from the tradition of NGOs, and this, although noble, is often misinterpreted as a sector in which people work for love and believe not for money. This also means that people are used and prone to accept lower paid jobs. This has somehow created a wrong tradition for which now it is almost assumed that these jobs should receive lower salary, this is unfair and should be inverted. People that work in this sector should be intact even reward more than other for the good service they bring to society at large.

Arguments (1)  Moderator Comments (0)

I think that the use of role models could help  /x  67%

Arguments (3)  Moderator Comments (0)

Usual passion work  100%
As future is near where, it is no use to be a millionaire and being human means more than any word, with a sort of middle basic revenue, people may participate to extend the idea of simple civil organisation ... it's about simple ways to live and to explain next is just so near I ... as idea in the world air. * civic means more about education for knowing rules in society as civil means just being an active citizen ... (as citizen is always taken by politics for their illustrations and ask... civil is the right (for me ) word ... => so to answer why's it's attractive to civil organisation is just easy ness and normal acts which will replace the word "work" in next 10s Y, time for all old dictatorship nations changes....

Arguments (1)  Moderator Comments (0)

Informal Certification and recognition  /x
Arguments (0)  Moderator Comments (0)

New idea  /x  *
Arguments (0)  Moderator Comments (0)
One of the main limit of common online forums is the lack of content structure. Content is presented as a time ordered list of posts and there is no way to summarise key contributions if not by reading the entire conversation.

Debatehub provides a specific data structure and UI and some visual stats which allows to easily identify the main ideas, pro and con without losing the intuitiveness of a textual interface.

In this way it is easier to immediately summarize the state of the debate, including identifying at a glance what are the most opposed or supported ideas (e.g. support/ opposition bar and debate health indicator)
How can we help participants find where they can do the most good?

- **Contributors**: where are the gaps?
- **Managers**: what discussions need intervention?
- **Customers**: what content is ready to be harvested?
A solution: **alerts algorithms** that provide customized recommendations by analyzing map and user activity.

Lurking User (2)
- Sam Sneed
- Lucy Percival

Mature Issue (5)
- How enhance bio-fuels production in Italy?
- How mitigate the employment impacts?
- ...

Interesting to Me (2)
- Use compressed air storage
- Lithium too limited to meet electric storage demands

Contentious Issue (1)
- Use fast breed nuclear for electric baseline supply

Emerging Winner (1)
- Long-term solar tax credits

Orphaned Idea (1)
- Vortex-based wind power

User activity analysis
Map topology
Eigenvector analysis
Bayesian belief propagation
Time series analysis
Post activity analysis
What would attract you to work in a civic sector organization?

Please add ideas on what would be your main motivation and reward for working in the civic society sector.

Better pays would help

Civic society organizations often come from the tradition of NGOs, and this, although noble, is often misinterpreted as a sector in which people work for love and believes and not for money. This also means that people are used and prone to accept lower paid job. This has somehow created a wrong tradition for which now it is almost assumed that these job should receive lower salary, this is unfair and should be inverted. People that work in this sector should be intact even reward more than other for the good service they bring to society at large.

I think that the use of role models could help

As future is near where, it is no use to be a millionaire and being human means more than any word, with a sort of middle basic revenue, people may participate to extend the idea of simple civil organizations ... it's about simple ways to live and to explain next is just so near ! as idea in the world air. Civic means more about education for knowing rules in society as civil means just being an active citizen ... (as citizen is always taken by politics for their illustrations and ask... civil is the right (for me) word ...). so to answer wath's attract me to civic organization is just easy ness and normal acts which will replace the word “work” in next 10s Y. time for all old dictatorship nations changes...
DebateHub has a series of moderator features to help reduce shallow contribution and cognitive clutters.

Moderators can merge similar ideas or split ideas that include more than one concept. Also Specific moderators’ alerts

Specific Moderators alerts help to focus group activities, spot biases and point out things that may have been overlooked.

Finally Debate Health indicators and personalised users’ alert support debate monitoring and help the community to improve, collaboration, diversity and participation.
Tackled Pain Points of Existing Social Innovation Platforms

- Poor Summarization
- Poor Visualization
- Shallow Contribution
- Poor Idea Evaluation
- Cognitive Clutters
- Platform Island and Balkanization
Emergent structuration and summarization of conversations

Assembl.org
DISCUSS & OBSERVE
Assembl (social media integration) & DebateHub (new ibis tools for online discussion)

HARVEST/CATCH
Assembl and Litemap (email snippets and Web annotation)

REFLECT, COMMUNICATE & SHARE
Reflect, communicate, and share features within each tool, what they are and what can they be used for.

CATEGORISE & MAP
Categorise and map features.

UNMARISE
Unmarshal data (communication function and process).

MONITOR & MODERATE
Monitor and moderate (including the debate's health and knowing where & how to intervene).
Importation of conversations from existing community tools: Email, RSS, Facebook, Drupal...

Harvesting of quotes from the conversation (harvester role)
Kate Scivens  3 months ago

What are the key drivers of youth well-being?
What are the factors that are most important for ensuring that young people have healthy and happy lives?

Frank Escoubes  3 months ago

I would have a look at some of the key dimensions in the Attali Report on the Positivity Index...  Read more

Patrick Han  3 months ago

In Asia, typically countries like China and J...  Read more

Will Suter  3 months ago

Patrick, I understand where you are coming from.

It is indeed the duty of parents to "guide their children," but at the same time it is a parents duty to set a different path. There is so aptly described, it is great. So, the change will not come from the system itself. This can be South Korea. I don't have a child, but it is interesting to point out.

Dr. Huda Alkitkat

In my opinion, the education environment can be adapted to allow young people to voice their concerns or respond to policy initiatives via the implementation of many activities inside schools.

Frank Escoubes

Fundamental Rights to Well Being

with support from Hilton Worldwide. I encourage everyone reading this discussion to check out not only the Index but also the country-specific fact sheets - 2 page outlines of all of the youth well-being indicators considered by the index. They can be a very helpful glimpse into...
"Self-drive, responsibility and expectations"

Expression in next synthesis
Self-drive, responsibility and expectations
Description of this idea
What is the role of self-drive and responsibility in youth well-being?

Independence for All

Yes, I believe that students should be self-driven rather than having someone else push you to become who he or she wants you to be. I go to a boarding school...

Phoebe
2 months ago

I agree that students should be self-driven. While it’s true that their motivations can be strong, I think that parental push can also be effective. I think that they still need to be guided in the right direction with a little less independence. I think this because some people have great inner motivation and have no trouble getting stuff done. However, other people can’t get as much done due to different genes, how they were raised, or previous educational/life experiences. So in high school, if a person is put under more regulations in the beginning that can help them to learn good habits, and so they will succeed more when they have true freedom.

About
The quotes are organized by moderators into a table of ideas (tree structure)

The table of ideas allows to navigate a section of the conversation

Lower barrier to entry into a large conversation, formation of sub-communities
Summarization (closing the loop)

- At intervals, community moderators summarize the key points from the table of ideas into a summary.
- The summary is pushed to all participants, ensuring common awareness.
- We find that it elicits new responses from lurkers.
"Update: Summary of week 8 of our consultation"

Hello everyone. We're now into our third week of Consultation on Youth Wellbeing. Last week a number of really interesting issues were progressed and raised.

How should we measure and define youth well-being?
- We may need a dual definition of wellbeing: one that is determined by current drivers and one defined by future drivers; wellbeing is a dynamic state, its definition should be organically evolving.
- Different countries consider youth to be adults at different times. Marriage is encouraged at different times. It seems adequate to consider that youth is a socio-cultural construct with different definitions in different countries and cultures.

By Kate Scrivens, Frank Escoubes, Lynnette Jiang, Irina Korgun, Marie Josselin, Anthony Le Bleis, Andrea View Idea

Definitions of 'Youth'
Apart from age, what else matters for defining “Youth”?
- By Kate Scrivens, Dr. Huda Alkittak, Sara Paraila, RP3328, Ali Dougal, Patrick Han, Hugo Steben, Laura Gillies, Mrcl Stefanik, Andrea Weber, Natacha Dufour View Idea

- Brain development (11-25)
  - By Alexandra Edwards View Idea

- That transitional period of time when one starts to become self-aware. Age does not define the barriers of youth.
  - By Ryan Wolter, Annie Bronfman, Natacha Dufour, David Renner View Idea

Cultural differences is
- By Irina Korgun View Idea

Conclusion
In the next iteration, we'll look at improving the process of creating youth engagement
Tackled Pain Points of Existing Social Innovation Platforms

- Poor Summarization
- Poor Visualization
- Shallow Contribution
- Poor Idea Evaluation
- Cognitive Clutters
- Platform Island and Balkanization
Visual Analytics service
cidashboard.net
REFLECT, COMMUNICATE & SHARE
- Collect and all tools (Reflect, Communicate & Share features within each tool, what they are and what can they be used for)

CATEGORISE & MAP
- Categorise the collected data and map it to a relevant category

SUMMARISE
- Summarise the information (collate, categorise and present)

MONITOR & MODERATE
- Monitor dashboard, database of usage and moderation of data
- Monitor the data's health and knowing where & how to intervene

REFLECT, COMMUNICATE & SHARE
- CI Dashboard and all tools (Reflect, Communicate & Share features within each tool, what they are and what can they be used for)
Integration

Services

Metric service

SNA service

Dashboard

Community platforms

LiteMap

Debate Hub

Assembl
Visualisations
Tackled Pain Points of Existing Social Innovation Platforms

- Poor Summarization
- Poor Visualization
- Shallow Contribution
- Poor Idea Evaluation
- Cognitive Clutters
- Platform Island and Balkanization
Collective Intelligence as an eco-system of tools
Deliverable and internal documents provide further information. We would be happy to answer any questions now!
Communities success stories and lessons learnt

Rosa Strube & Catalyst Consortium

CSCP
CAPS2015 Conference
Brussels | July 8, 2015

This project has received funding from the European Union’s Seventh Framework Programme for research, technological development and demonstration under grant agreement n°6611188
„Why do communities need tools like the ones developed by Catalyst for making use of the potential of collective intelligence?“
Our tools in action

Edgesense

FabLab France Mailing List
Python Mailing List
Our tools in action
Our tools in action
Our tools in action
Meet our tools in action:
Community testing panel

Edgesense

Assembl

Debate Hub

LiteMap

This project has received funding from the European Union’s Seventh Framework Programme for research, technological development and demonstration under grant agreement n°6611188
Community testing Panel

- **Alberto Cottica** - Wikitalia
  Edgeryder test with Edgesense

- **Ruxandra Creosteanu** - Edgeryders and co-founder Babele
  Edgeryder test with Assembl

- **Quentin Grimaud** - Imagination for the people
  OECD test with Assembl

- **Lee-Sean Huang** - Purpose
  University of Naples test with Debate Hub
Q & A:
What would you like to know about the testing?
Lessons Learnt:
When our tools can be most useful
General framework
Success factors for getting the best out of the tools

The goal
• Discuss a rather complex issue
• Easier if a desired outcome is defined

The timeframe
• Either a limited time frame
• or an issue where new content is evolving relatively quickly
The participants

Success factors for getting the best out of the tools

The participants
- Distributed to different places, so that face to face meetings are no alternative
- A bit open to technical things

The community
- Community is either not yet using an online tool or is unhappy with the functions the one it is using offers
Motivations
Success factors for getting the best out of the tools

**Motivation of community**
- Need to see a benefit in sharing information with others

**Motivation of community manager**
- Need to see the benefits of the tool compared to existing ways of engagement
- Needs to be able to take a decision
Thanks for your time!
Any questions?

Rosa Strube
@rosastrube

CSCP
Bruxelles 1-8 July 2015
Questions to test beds

- What did the OECD/University of Naples/Edgeryders name as reasons to decide to use the tools developed by the Catalyst project? What were their expectations?

- In a few words, how was the testing done? Who was involved, over which time period?

- What was the result of the testing? What did OECD/University of Naples/Edgeryders perceive as the highest benefits it generate to the community, the harvesters and the discussion?